Case 1:15-cv-01980-GHW Document 54 Filed 01/12/16 Page 1 of 3



Sanford Heisler Kimpel, LLP 1666 Connecticut Ave., NW, Suite 300 Washington, DC 20009 Telephone: (202) 499-5200 Fax: (202) 499-5199 www.sanfordheisler.com

Washington D.C. | New York | San Francisco | San Diego

January 12, 2016

VIA ECF

The Honorable Gregory H. Woods United States District Judge Southern District of New York 500 Pearl Street New York, New York 10007-1312

> Re: <u>Dickerson et al. v. Novartis Corporation and Alcon Laboratories, Inc.</u> Civil No. 1:15-CV-01980-GHW

Dear Judge Woods:

Plaintiffs respectfully submit this letter and its attached exhibits in response to this Court's Order dated December 30, 2015 (Dkt. No. 46). That Order directed plaintiffs to submit additional information regarding:

- 1. A copy of the plaintiffs' expert report, or a detailed affidavit setting forth the report's conclusions and the methodology employed to reach those conclusions;
- 2. The pay and benefit structure, including the range of compensation, for each of the positions described in the four proposed classes;
- 3. The criteria used by plaintiffs to select the third-party neutral;
- 4. The instructions provided to the third-party neutral regarding the allocation of settlement funds;
- 5. The third-party neutral's basis for the proposed allocation of the settlement fund between "Base Payments" and "Supplemental Payments;" and
- 6. The third-party neutral's basis for the proposed allocation of the settlement fund between the four proposed classes.

Additionally, the Order directed plaintiffs to submit the right to sue letters identified in the amended complaint.

Case 1:15-cv-01980-GHW Document 54 Filed 01/12/16 Page 2 of 3

The Honorable Gregory H. Woods January 12, 2016

Page 2 of 3

The Representative Plaintiffs provide additional information regarding item (1) in Exhibit

A hereto, which is a declaration from Plaintiffs' expert, Alexander Vekker, Ph.D.

The Representative Plaintiffs provide additional information regarding items (2)-(3) in

Exhibit B hereto, which is a declaration from David Sanford, who is lead counsel in this action.

The Representative Plaintiffs provide additional information regarding items (4)-(6) in

Exhibit C hereto, which is a declaration from the third-party neutral, Carol Wittenberg.

Plaintiffs submit the right to sue letters identified in the amended complaint in Exhibit D

hereto.

The Representative Plaintiffs provide additional information regarding points of law

raised by the Court in its Order dated December 30, 2015, in Exhibit E hereto, which is a

supplemental memorandum of law addressing those points.

Finally, the Representative Plaintiffs and Defendants have simultaneously filed a Joint

Application for Leave to File Redacted Documents, which seeks leave of court to file redacted

versions of the Vekker, Sanford, and Wittenberg declarations.

Respectfully submitted,

David Sanford, D.C. Bar No. 457933

SANFORD HEISLER KIMPEL, LLP

1666 Connecticut Avenue NW, Suite 300

Washington, DC 20009

Telephone: (202) 499-5201

Facsimile: (202) 499-5199

dsanford@sanfordheisler.com

Case 1:15-cv-01980-GHW Document 54 Filed 01/12/16 Page 3 of 3

The Honorable Gregory H. Woods January 12, 2016 Page 3 of 3

Jeremy Heisler (JH-0145)
Andrew Melzer (AM-7649)
Alexandra Harwin, D.C Bar No. 1003018
SANFORD HEISLER KIMPEL, LLP
1350 Avenue of the Americas, 31st Floor
New York, New York 10019
Telephone: (646) 402-5656
Facsimile: (646) 402-5650
jheisler@sanfordheisler.com
aharwin@sanfordheisler.com

Felicia Medina (Cal. Bar No. 255804)

SANFORD HEISLER KIMPEL, LLP

111 Sutter Street, Suite 975

San Francisco, CA 94104

Telephone: (415) 795-2024

Facsimile: (415) 795-2021

fmedina@sanfordheisler.com

Counsel for Plaintiffs